

Bible's social world, and to literary context. Discussion of the last point segues into a more theological concern, as B. argues that individual texts should be related not only to the book in which they are found but also to other texts of Scripture and, ultimately, to the witness of canon. This leads nicely into a two-chapter discussion of "conceptualization": B. believes that contemporary meaning assigned to biblical texts should cohere with the original meaning of those texts, and it should provide for recontextualization that fulfills the author's purposes. She also wants to take seriously the divine and human character of biblical writings, though it is not clear from the brief discussion here whether appreciation of the latter would ever allow a properly construed conceptualization of Scripture to be rejected as misdirection. Does B.'s hermeneutical model provide any place for what has been termed "resistant reading"?

The book concludes with five appendixes that provide guidelines for doing exegesis of various kinds of texts. Although B.'s book is attentive to the question of *meaning*, there is a noticeable lack of interest in the question of *authority*. For example, some attention is paid to the meaning of texts for communities, but there is no discussion of the role that either ecclesial authorities or confessional documents might play in the determination of meaning that would be deemed authoritative for particular communities.

Brown's book would serve well as a textbook in classes on hermeneutics. It is perhaps best designed for schools within the Protestant tradition that want to promote traditional interpretive strategies but that also want students to be well informed regarding ideological options and to be cognizant of the challenges to author-heavy conceptions of meaning that have been raised in recent years.

Mark Allan Powell, Trinity Lutheran Seminary, Columbus, OH 43209

ROBINSON BUTARBUTAR, *Paul and Conflict Resolution: An Exegetical Study of Paul's Apostolic Paradigm in 1 Corinthians 9* (Paternoster Biblical Monographs; Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2007). Pp. xviii + 275. Paper £19.99.

Butarbutar primarily demonstrates that Paul renounces his right to financial support in 1 Corinthians 9 as an example of pastoral practice aimed at an amicable resolution for the dispute over meat sacrificed to idols. Methodologically, B. sets out to "take the text as the primary consideration in establishing the nature of the problem" (p. 10) and proposes to utilize a "socio-historical study" (p. 10) of Corinth as a Roman city in order better to understand the nature of the crisis.

In chap. 2, B. establishes the historical and literary contexts for 1 Cor 8:1–11:1. Noting that the religious and social are inseparable, B. proposes that the issue of meat sacrificed to idols was one of *boundaries*. Those who wished to abstain feared regressing into former religious/social practices and thus were not open to interaction with the larger society. Conversely, those who did not abstain were open to society on the basis of their theological knowledge and status of freedom. Paul is trying to hold this community together. B. concludes that 1 Corinthians 9 forms part of a literary unity serving primarily as Paul's apostolic example where he maintains his right to remuneration yet chooses not to exercise it.

In the third and fourth chapters, B. focuses on 1 Corinthians 9 as indicative of Paul's apostolic paradigm. B. gives a historical/cultural context to Paul's renunciation of *exousia*

(9:4-18), the model of slavery used to support this renunciation (9:19-23), and the image of an athlete disciplining his body (9:24-27). Paul, by example, hopes to teach those claiming their right to eat meat sacrificed to idols that although the principles on which they base their position are correct, they nonetheless should relinquish this right for the sake of the "weak." Finally, in chap. 5, B. shows this Pauline principle operative in a serious crisis experienced by the Batak Christian Protestant Church in Indonesia during the 1990s. Military intervention in church affairs caused a division into two factions. Reconciliation was realized through each party's willingness to forgo its "justification" of its position (p. 234).

One benefit of B.'s work is his position that the Corinthian dispute over meat sacrificed to idols arose out of the city's religio-political dynamics and "mood" (pp. 55-61, 236). This adds to the long-discussed notions that Paul himself, foreign teachings, or differences between rich and poor were responsible for the dispute. Especially illuminating is the clear picture B. provides of serious social consequences for Corinthians who chose not to follow the pattern of the larger society and thus for those who would refrain from eating meat sacrificed to idols. For example, the presence of the imperial cult, which was associated with the Isthmian Games and benefited the city's economy, made nonparticipation very difficult for Christians and "against the mood of their contemporaries" (p. 72).

Butarbutar also convincingly argues that Paul's relinquishing of his right to remuneration results from his understanding of the "character" of the gospel, which means that "the gospel itself is free of charge" because it is "the gospel of Christ crucified" (p. 159). Yet, as B. indicates, Paul did accept financial support (1 Cor 16:6; 2 Cor 11:7-11; Phil 4:15-16, 18). B.'s explanation of this through a distinction between Paul's relinquished right of "living off the gospel" and "other forms of support he enjoyed" seems forced (pp. 207-8). Further, given B.'s statement that Paul's gospel was that of "Christ crucified," a more developed discussion of the phrase "law of Christ" in 1 Cor 9:21, which B. mentions as linked to love (p. 185), is warranted. In view of the importance of 1 Corinthians 13, this Pauline imperative deserves more emphasis in B.'s discussion of what Paul relinquishes as a "right" so as not to hinder the gospel. Finally, insofar as the Corinthian situation generally serves as a model for disputing parties to relinquish rights in order to resolve a conflict, the analogy with the Batak Christian Protestant Church situation is helpful. But questions do arise. For example, who would be considered the strong party with "socially and politically legitimate arguments" (p. 238), and who the weak party with the "theologically illegitimate position" (p. 238)? Who would decide?

None of this takes away significantly from the depth and quality of B.'s work. His basic thesis is convincing and his research is sound. In addition, the publication is most timely, as we live in a world fraught with religious conflicts. It is hoped that this book will be widely read.

William J. Shaules, Loyola Marymount University, Los Angeles, CA 90045

ANDREW D. CLARKE, *A Pauline Theology of Church Leadership* (Library of New Testament Studies 362; London/New York: Clark, 2008). Pp. viii + 212. \$130.

Tracing a theology of church leadership in Paul's letters is far from a straightforward task. Clarke seems to spend nearly as much time demonstrating the difficulty of the task as

Copyright of Catholic Biblical Quarterly is the property of Catholic Biblical Association of America and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.